

UEFA Champions League 2012 / 2013

Round of 16

(TUR) Galatasaray		1:1		Schalke 04 (GER)
20 February 2013, 20:45 CET – Sükrü Sarioglu, Istanbul, Turkey				

Match Officials	Name	Origin	Mark ¹	Mark ²	Difficulty ³
Referee	William Collum	SCO	8.3	-	Normal
Assistant Referee 1	Martin Cryans	SCO	8.4	-	Normal
Assistant Referee 2	William Conquer	SCO	8.4	-	Normal
Additional AR 1	Robert Madden	SCO	8.0	-	Normal
Additional AR 2	John Beaton	SCO	8.0	-	Normal
Fourth Official	Alan Mulvanny	SCO	8.0	-	Normal
UEFA Referee Observer	Pierluigi Collina	ITA			
Blog-Referee Observer ⁴	Filipe T.	POR			

¹ Final mark according to evaluation scale. Expected level for AARs and fourth official is 8.0, crucial mistake 7.9 as usual!

² Mark if the final mark had not been influenced by a crucial mistake (only in case of a crucial mistake, to be held empty if no crucial mistake occurred).

³ Difficulty has to be integrated into the final mark. Levels of difficulty are: "normal", "challenging" and "very challenging".

⁴ Blog-Referee Observer =Inofficial referee observer appointed by the blog administrator.

Evaluation scale	Description of the Marks
9.0 – 10.0	Excellent.
8.5 – 8.9	Very good. Important decision(s) correctly taken.
8.3 – 8.4	Good. Expected level.
8.2	Satisfactory with small areas for improvement.
8.0 – 8.1	Satisfactory with important areas for improvement.
7.9	One clear and important mistake, otherwise 8.3 or above.
7.8	One clear and important mistake, otherwise 8.0 – 8.2.
7.5 – 7.7	Below expectation, poor control, significant point(s) for improvement.
7.0 – 7.4	Disappointing. Below expectation with one and clear important mistakes or a performance with two or more clear and important mistakes.
6.0 – 6.9	Unacceptable.

Description of the match:

Cold night in Istanbul for the first leg of this knock-out phase of 2012-2013. With an almost full stadium and a great environment the Turkish team returns to the elimination phase of CL against Schalke 04.

Tonight's ref is Collum, Elite from UEFA ref's board. William Collum is taking charge of his ninth UEFA CL game. He was present as main ref in former European matches of both teams.

For Collum this is the first elimination phase match as center ref in UEFA CL.

Referee

I. Knowledge, Application and Interpretation of the Laws of the Game, Disciplinary Control and Technical Management of the game with special reference to the situations and the minutes when they occurred. (Crucial decisions, if available, have to be explicitly mentioned in the grid and highlighted).	
Comments: With a regular performance in not challenging match Collum delivered as strongest aspects his speed and fitness. The position in the field and the use of advantage rule were very good. No problems detected concerning the LoG. Minor faults in technical aspects. The disciplinary criteria needs to be worked a bit more to achieve a consistent approach line to the match. Finally, he should work more in player-ref relation.	
Minute	Description of the situation
4'	Foul near S04 area. Gal player no.55 tackles S04 no.35. Collum with a verbal warning. Correct posture.
10'	Foul on Galatasaray no.1. Collum with play-on decision, but was a push and obstruction to GK movement. The GK catches the ball, so no big repercussions.
11'	S04 no.32 fouled by Galatasaray no4. Correct call. Possible warning or even an YC.
12'	Goal! Galatasaray (clean goal).
16'	Galatasaray no4 fouled by S04 no.9. No intention to play the ball. Possible warning needed or even an YC.
17'	YC for Galatasaray no.1. For protests.
17'	Good advantage given in an attack of Turkish team.
18'	S04 Attack move blocked by Galatasaray player 26. The correct decision would be a YC for the Turkish team player. Collum was bit apathy, waiting for instructions of the assistants.
29'	Correctly awards a foul against Galatasaray. Maintains the very wide criteria.
35'	Collum gives an YC to Jones (S04) apparently for "requesting an YC for the opponent". Collum's decision in this aspect was a bit controversial to me. Although a new directive from de UEFA ref's board commands the ref to give a YC in that sort of situation, in this case the player was not that effusive. So still controversial.
45'	Goal! S04 (clean goal)
45+2'	2 minutes added to the first half due to injuries. Correct.
48'	Correct YC for Galatasaray no.53
54	Possible penalty against Galatasaray. Always a dubious situation to judge. The situation can be judged as play on or penalty, although I recognize the difficulty to make a decision. In this aspect Collum followed the the correct call because that wasn't a clear penalty situation.
67'	YC for Galatasaray no. 13 for obstruction. In first half a similar situation with different decision. Seemed a Soft first half Collum vs. harsh second half Collum.
78'	YC for S04 no.35 for obstruction. Correct call.
87'	YC for S04 no.12. Correct.
90'	YC for Galatasaray no.8. In this case he showed an YC, In others with similarities not. Although a foul with no ball blocking an opponent's attack move justifies the YC.
90+1	Why not YC for Galatasaray no17?

II. Tactical approach and its Degree of Consistency, Personality, Match Control and Management of the Teams and Players with special reference to the situations and the minutes when they occurred.

Comments:

As commented above some inconsistencies with similar situations concerning yellow cards.

Positive Points	1.	Fitness and speed
	2.	Advantage rule
	3.	
Points to improve	1.	Card management
	2.	Player-ref relation
	3.	

Minute	Description of the situation

III. Physical Shape, Stamina, Positioning, Movement as well as Mental Awareness, if needed, with reference to the minutes when they occurred, always in case of a “-“.

Physical Condition (very good, good, average, poor): Very Good

Further Aspects:

+	Expected	-	
x			Always close to play, follows play at all times with a flexible diagonal system and impedes interference with play
x			Efficient positioning (at set pieces e.g.) and movement to be ready to take a (crucial) decision (specially in the box; be able to enter the box in some cases when it is necessary)
	X		Shows awareness and is able to anticipate the action

Minute	Description of the situation

IV. Teamwork (co-operation with (A)ARs and fourth official with reference, if needed, to special situations and the minutes when they occurred)

Comments:

Expected cooperation.

Assistant Referee 1

Assistant referee's performance (please mention some important decisions either by integrating them into a coherent comment or mentioning them in the grid below; mandatory if a "-" (negative point) is selected)

Relevant Aspects:

+	Expected	-	
	X		Correct offside decisions by means of a good application of the "wait and see"-technique
	X		Good positioning and movement
	X		Mental alertness and reaction to incidents in his area of vicinity
	X		Reasonable degree of co-operation with referee (not flagging too much / too little; being able to support referee in crucial decisions)
	X		Efficient control at set pieces

Minute	Description of the situation
46'	Correct off-side taken.
53'	Idem.

Assistant Referee 2

Assistant referee's performance (please mention some important decisions either by integrating them into a coherent comment or mentioning them in the grid below; mandatory if a "-" (negative point) is selected)

Relevant Aspects:

+	Expected	-	
	X		Correct offside decisions by means of a good application of the "wait and see"-technique
	X		Good positioning and movement
x			Mental alertness and reaction to incidents in his area of vicinity
	X		Reasonable degree of co-operation with referee (not flagging too much / too little; being able to support referee in crucial decisions)
	X		Efficient control at set pieces

Minute	Description of the situation
17'	Correct off-side taken.
65'	Idem

Additional Assistant Referee 1

Assistant referee's performance (please mention some important decisions either by integrating them into a coherent comment or mentioning them in the grid below; mandatory if a "-" (negative point) is selected)

Relevant Aspects:			
+	Expected	-	
	X		Good positioning and movement
	X		Mental alertness and reaction to incidents in his area of vicinity based on a reasonable degree of co-operation with referee
	X		Efficient control at set pieces
Comments:			
Minute	Description of the situation		

Additional Assistant Referee 2

Assistant referee's performance (please mention some important decisions either by integrating them into a coherent comment or mentioning them in the grid below; mandatory if a "-" (negative point) is selected)

Relevant Aspects:			
+	Expected	-	
	X		Good positioning and movement
	X		Mental alertness and reaction to incidents in his area of vicinity based on a reasonable degree of co-operation with referee
	X		Efficient control at set pieces
Comments:			
Minute	Description of the situation		

Fourth Official

Fourth official's performance (reference to technical management like substitutions or signalling of additional time, dealing with benches in case of conflicts)

Comments: Correctly signaled added time in both halves.
